



BOARD OF DIRECTORS

MARCH 23, 2018

ACTION REQUESTED: APPROVE

**SAN DIEGO FORWARD: THE 2019-2050 REGIONAL PLAN
PERFORMANCE MEASURES**

File Number 3102000

Introduction

San Diego Forward: The Regional Plan (Regional Plan) is a federally- and state-mandated document that presents the overall vision for how the San Diego region will grow through 2050, including all of the transportation-related investments that will be needed to support that vision. The Regional Plan is updated every four years and must be fiscally constrained, meaning the cost of projects and programs included must be supported by current revenue sources as well as reasonably expected new sources.

Recommendation

The Transportation and Regional Planning Committees recommend that the Board of Directors approve the proposed performance measures for use in the development of San Diego Forward: The 2019-2050 Regional Plan.

In order for the Board of Directors to determine the final combination of projects to fulfill the vision of the Regional Plan, several scenarios are developed for evaluation and consideration. Once the scenarios are developed, performance measures are used to evaluate the various combinations. The performance measures help answer key questions to provide a "scorecard" that compares and contrasts how the different combinations of transportation projects help support innovative mobility and planning, a vibrant economy, and a healthy environment and communities in the San Diego region.

The Regional Planning and Transportation Committees recommended that the Board of Directors approve the proposed performance measures for use in the development of San Diego Forward: The 2019-2050 Regional Plan (2019 Regional Plan) at their respective March 2, 2018, and March 16, 2018, meetings.

Discussion

Background

Performance measures are used to answer key questions that help to evaluate multimodal transportation network scenarios against one another. Based on this comparison, the Board of Directors will be asked to select a Preferred Transportation Scenario, which is the final mix of projects and programs that will be used as the basis of the 2019 Regional Plan. Throughout this process, staff also evaluates whether the various scenarios meet the regional per capita greenhouse gas emissions reduction targets for cars and light trucks established by the California Air Resources Board per Senate Bill 375 (Steinberg, 2008). A Title VI analysis, which measures the comparative distributions of

benefits and burdens of the transportation network scenarios to ensure there is no disproportionate impact on Social Equity Focused (SEF) populations, also will be performed.

Performance Measures

The performance measures from the 2015 Regional Plan were used as a starting point for the development of the proposed performance measures for the 2019 Regional Plan. The 2015 Regional Plan performance measures included ten key questions which were answered with data from 22 performance measures. Initial updates were made to the performance measures to align federal performance measurement efforts and with feedback from stakeholders from throughout the region, the public, SANDAG Policy Advisory Committees, and the Board of Directors.

Staff sought input on the proposed performance measures from stakeholders at meetings of standing SANDAG working groups and the *TransNet* Independent Taxpayer Oversight Committee. Staff also solicited feedback on the draft performance measures at a December 2017 workshop and via an online survey. A peer review panel comprised of professionals with expertise in performance measurement and modeling also was convened to provide feedback on opportunities to further strengthen and streamline the performance measures and key questions. A summary of the input received and peer panel recommendations is included in Attachment 1.

Based on the recommendations of the Peer Review Panel and input received from the SANDAG working groups, stakeholders, and public, initial draft performance measures were developed and shared with the Transportation and Regional Planning Committees at their February 2, 2018 meetings. These performance measures contained eight questions and 12 performance measures and include new regional and per capita vehicle miles traveled (VMT) measures. Measures related to travel times to neighboring counties, Mexico, tribal lands, and military installations, to transportation costs, and to physical activity were included as additional performance measures which could be modeled and also included in the 2019 Regional Plan to demonstrate how the plan helps to serve the transportation needs of the region.

Policy Advisory Committee Feedback

At their February 2, 2018, meetings, the Regional Planning and Transportation Committees provided feedback on the draft list of performance measures which would be used to compare and evaluate various multimodal transportation scenarios. The Policy Advisory Committees also commented on the set of additional metrics.

Both Policy Advisory Committees noted the importance of measuring how the transportation system helps people get to jobs, school, and access other services efficiently and safely. There also was interest in evaluating VMT by local jurisdiction. Committee members appreciated that feedback was sought on the draft performance measures from working groups, stakeholders, and the public, and felt the recommendations of the peer review were helpful in creating a shorter list of performance measures that could be used to help evaluate transportation scenarios.

Two performance measures were modified to address Policy Advisory Committee comments regarding access to regional job centers, and population and employment near to major transit stops. Three additional measures were proposed to be added to the Social Equity analysis to evaluate transportation system benefits for low-income persons, transit access, and physical activity for SEF communities.

Staff also examined potential methodologies for measuring VMT at the jurisdiction level. SANDAG has provided jurisdictional VMT data to many jurisdictions as part of their Climate Action Plan development and monitoring efforts, and will continue to support these efforts. However, it was determined that current staff resources do not allow for VMT data to be calculated with the same Climate Action Plan methodology for each of the 2019 Regional Plan network scenarios and phase years. That said, staff will be able to produce regional and per capita VMT data for each of the plan's network scenarios.

Both Policy Advisory Committees noted the challenge that many residents face in securing affordable housing, especially in areas that are near jobs and public transit. However, current modeling tools do not allow for the projection of specific housing unit costs or home ownership. Housing and transportation cost information will be compiled for the base year of the Regional Plan (2016) and can serve as information for the transportation network development process to highlight communities that currently are facing housing and transportation affordability challenges. Staff will be working to align this effort with the Regional Housing Needs Assessment process.

At its meeting on March 16, 2018, the Transportation Committee recommended the addition of an air quality performance measure, which now is included as performance measure 6b and will measure on-road smog-forming and particulate matter pollutants per capita. The Transportation Committee also requested that staff review information regarding future VMT projections for electric/clean fuel vehicles and consider highlighting VMT from electric/clean fuel vehicles in the data projected for performance measure 2b, which measures regionwide and per capita VMT. Also, it was clarified that for performance measure 2a, the percent of trips by mode (walk, bike, transit, and carpool) will be available separately.

Attachment 2 provides a list of 13 proposed performance measures which would be used to answer eight key questions in order to compare and evaluate the various multimodal transportation scenarios. Attachment 3 provides a set of additional metrics which could be modeled and included in the 2019 Regional Plan to demonstrate how the plan helps to serve the transportation needs of the region.

Next Steps

Pending approval by the Board of Directors, the performance measures will be applied to the transportation network scenarios developed in spring/summer 2018 and the results will be shared with the Policy Advisory Committees and Board.

KIM KAWADA
Chief Deputy Executive Director

Attachments: 1. Summary of Input on the Draft 2019 Regional Plan Performance Measures
2. Key Questions and Draft Performance Measures
3. Additional Draft Performance Measures

Key Staff Contact: Rachel Kennedy, (619) 699-1929, rachel.kennedy@sandag.org

Summary of Input on the Draft 2019 Regional Plan Performance Measures

SANDAG Working Groups and TransNet Independent Taxpayer Oversight Committee

Staff sought input on the draft performance measures from stakeholders at meetings of the Active Transportation Working Group, Cities/County Transportation Advisory Committee, Interagency Technical Working Group on Tribal Transportation Issues, Freight Stakeholders Working Group, San Diego Regional Military Working Group, Regional Planning Technical Working Group, San Diego Regional Traffic Engineers Council, Social Services Transportation Advisory Council, and *TransNet* Independent Taxpayer Oversight Committee. Interest was expressed in performance measures that quantify network connectivity, goods movement mobility, air quality and climate change, and financial sustainability.

Community-Based Organizations

SANDAG has partnered with 13 community-based organizations (CBOs) to assist with outreach to traditionally underserved communities throughout the development process for the 2019 Regional Plan. Staff sought input from the CBOs at its November and December 2017 meetings. Meeting participants expressed interest in metrics that measured accessibility to jobs and other key destinations via transit, safety for transit users, and greenhouse gas (GHG) reductions.

Public Outreach: Public Workshop and Online Survey

On December 4, 2017, a public workshop was held at Caltrans to solicit public input on the draft performance measures with more than 100 participants. Attendees participated in facilitated discussions (in English and Spanish) and comments received included requests for measures of congestion, vehicle miles traveled, health outcome metrics, transit frequency, bicycle and pedestrian facility quality, and first mile/last mile concerns.

An online survey also was launched on December 4, 2017, to gather additional input. More than 300 individuals participated in the survey, which was available in English and Spanish. Comments received included requests for measures of congestion relief, vehicle miles traveled, air quality and climate change, transit accessibility and use, and active transportation.

Peer Review Panel

A peer review panel also was convened to provide feedback on opportunities to further strengthen the performance measures and key questions. The panelists were provided with the 2015 Regional Plan performance measures; draft 2019 Regional Plan performance measures; and comments from the SANDAG working groups, CBOs, public workshop, and online survey in advance of the meeting. The panelists, which included professionals from academia, the U.S. Federal Highway Administration Resource Center, metropolitan planning organizations, and the private sector, met at SANDAG on January 17, 2018. After a day-long meeting, the panel provided recommendations for revision and enhancement to the draft performance measures.

The recommendations of the panel focused on three overarching themes: (1) Include fewer metrics which measure what is most important and are supported by quality data; (2) Focus on creating distinct transportation network scenarios that include different combinations of projects,

technologies, or funding strategies; and (3) Provide simple graphics and text to convey the results of the measures and why they matter.

The panel recommended that SANDAG create a two-tiered system of performance measures with a limited number of primary key questions and performance measures, which would be used to compare the performance of the transportation scenarios in the areas of mode share, delay, safety, social equity, GHG reductions, and public health. The additional metrics could be modeled and included in the 2019 Regional Plan for informational purposes.

A summary of the input received through the draft performance measure development outreach process and peer review panel is available on sdfoward.com.

Key Questions and Draft Performance Measures

2019 Regional Plan Goals	Key Question	Draft 2019 Regional Plan Transportation Network Performance Measures	Proposed for Inclusion in Social Equity Analysis
Innovative Mobility and Planning	1. Is delay reduced?	1a. Daily vehicle delay per capita (minutes)	
	2. Are more people walking, biking, using transit, and sharing rides?	2a. Percent of trips by walk, bike, transit, and carpool (work trips and all trips) regionwide and within Urban Area Transit Strategy (UATS) districts.	
		2b. VMT (per capita and regionwide)	
	3. Is the transportation system safer?	3a. Vehicular fatalities and serious injuries per capita	
3b. Non-motorized fatalities and non-motorized serious injuries per capita			
Vibrant Economy	4. Do the transportation investments help to improve the regional economy?	4a. Benefit/Cost Ratio of transportation investments	X
Healthy Environment and Communities	5. Does the transportation network support smart growth?	5a. Percentage of population/employment within 0.5-mile of high-frequency (≤ 15 min peak) transit stops	X
		5b. Percentage of population/employment within 0.25-mile of a bike facility (Class I and II, cycletrack, and bike boulevard)	
	6. How does the transportation network support public health?	6a. Time engaged in transportation-related physical activity per capita (minutes)	X
		6b. On-road smog-forming and particulate matter pollutants per capita	
	7. Is access to jobs and key destinations improving for all communities?	7a. Percent of population within 30 minutes jobs and higher education (via driving, transit) (total population, disadvantaged communities (seniors, low-income, and minority), and non-disadvantaged communities)	X
		7b. Percent of population within 15 minutes of goods and services (retail, medical, parks, and beaches) (via driving, transit) (total population, disadvantaged communities (seniors, low-income, and minority), and non-disadvantaged communities)	X
8. Are greenhouse gas emissions reduced?	8a. On-road CO2 emissions (pounds/day) (per capita and regionwide)		

The Social Equity analysis metrics include the total population, disadvantaged communities (seniors, low-income, and minority), and non-disadvantaged communities.

Additional Draft Performance Measures

2019 Regional Plan Goals	Draft 2019 Regional Plan Additional Performance Measures	Proposed for Inclusion in Social Equity Analysis
Innovative Mobility and Planning	A. Average peak-period travel time to work (drive alone, carpool, transit, bike, and walk) (minutes)	X
	B. Average travel times to/from tribal lands (minutes)	
	C. Average travel times to/from Mexico (minutes)	
	D. Average travel times to/from neighboring counties (Imperial, Orange, Riverside) (minutes)	
	E. Average travel times to/from military bases/installations (minutes)	
Vibrant Economy	F. Change in percent of income consumed by transportation costs	X
Healthy Environment and Communities	G. Percentage of population/employment within 0.5-mile of a major transit stop per California Code section 21064.3.	X
	H. Percent of population engaging in more than 20 minutes of daily transportation related physical activity	X